

January 16, 2013

**Response of the Government of Yemen and IBRD on the Approval by Mail: Revised Project Concept under the Strategic Program for Climate Resilience for Yemen**

**Yemen**

**Pilot Scheme to Improve the Resilience of Rural Communities to Climate Change in Yemen (IRRCCC)**

**Summary of Written Comments Received from Donors**

*Comments have been received from German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development on October 19, 2012, and from the UK Department for International Development on October 23, 2012.*

Comments	Source	Team Response
<b>Overall Comments</b>		
<p>We would like to commend all involved parties for submitting a well prepared proposal, which is written in a very comprehensive way with clear goals and indicators. Soil and water conservation as well as agricultural diversification as main intervention areas, combined with risk and knowledge management, constitute a well-defined approach for Yemen, where water resources are in extremely short supply and a rapidly growing population is heavily depending on agriculture in order to ensure food security.</p> <p>We have no major objections to the implementation of the project. We have some recommendations (see bold highlights below) that we propose to be taken into account in the further project design.</p>	<p align="center"><b>Germany</b></p>	<p>Thank you. The Government of Yemen would like to thank the Government of Germany for all the support provided. We are grateful for the provided comments which will allow further strengthening of the preparation process. The Yemeni team notes with appreciation the active and helpful participation of the German colleagues to advance the PPCR process in Yemen.</p>
<p>The UK welcomes and endorses the revised project concept under the SPCR for Yemen. The comments made by the representative for Germany were very useful for further project development, and it will be particularly important that as the proposal is developed, progress is made on the issues flagged around participation, gender, learning and project synergies.</p>	<p align="center"><b>UK</b></p>	<p>Thank you. The Government of Yemen would like to thank the Government of the United Kingdom for all the support provided. We are grateful for the provided comments which will allow further strengthening of the preparation process. The Yemeni team notes with appreciation the active and helpful participation of the UK colleagues to advance the PPCR process in Yemen.</p>
<b>Recommendations</b>		

Comments	Source	Team Response
<p>Based on former impact assessments (resp. WB, 2010) and Yemeni strategy papers (National Agriculture Sector Strategy, National Food Security Strategy and National Water Sector Strategy and Investment Program), the project design addresses the combined main vulnerabilities and challenges posed by climate change: agriculture, food security and lack of water resources. Different institutional entities are in charge and one of the key risks is (see section F iii) the poor coordination and collaboration between them, both horizontally and vertically. Therefore we highly recommend fostering cooperation, knowledge sharing and networking through the establishment of respective platforms and intersectoral and intergovernmental committees in order to ensure transparency and to optimise needed collaboration and coordination.</p>	<p><b>Germany</b></p>	<p>Thank you for this helpful comment. We agree that building and maintaining better coordination is a core element to success for every project/program. The coordination of multiple entities indeed poses a challenge. It is recognized as a challenge and efforts will be made to address this by establishing transparent and participatory implementation procedures; developing continuous and appropriate capacity building programs for key stakeholders and regular monitoring missions by the SFD and MAI, with the participation of the World Bank and supported by the IFC.</p> <p>As a first and important step, the Inter-Ministerial Committee on Climate Change (IMCCC) has been formally established, which is being supported by the Environment Protection Authority as its Technical Secretariat and is meeting regularly to guide the activities under the PPCR</p>
<p>Besides the already mentioned ministries and agencies, the Ministry of Water and Environment (MWE) as well as the National Water Resources Authority (NWRA) should also be involved in the project planning and implementation since they are crucial stakeholders and are already active in many fields of intervention targeted in the proposal (see National Water Sector Strategy and Investment Program NWSSIP).</p>	<p><b>Germany</b></p>	<p>Thanking you for this comment. These agencies are already considered to be stakeholders but we will make sure that those agencies are included throughout preparation and implementation of the project. This is also ensured, as the Minister for Water and Environment, is a member of the IMCCC.</p>
<p>We also recommend <b>analysing and using already existing structures at the regional and local levels</b> (water user associations and water basin committees) to avoid overlapping and the creation of double structures. We encourage an active cooperation with other donors and international institutions besides the ones already mentioned and recommend taking into consideration their lessons learned and creating synergies and making use of contacts and capacities (see below).</p>	<p><b>Germany</b></p>	<p>Special efforts are already being undertaken under Phase 1 PPCR which is developing a comprehensive framework for the development and implementation of the Climate Information System Investment. This activity is also identifying in detail all the key stakeholders, both at national, regional and local level, and map their potential roles in the proposed information system and assess data, technical, and management requirements for participation in a centralized information sharing system for climate data gathering, processing, and dissemination. The activity will also assess institutional capabilities to manage climate change information systems. This capacity assessment includes formal and informal community-based institutions such as Water User Associations, private sector etc. The activity also includes an assessment of the necessary specialized training needs for managing the climate information system. This will be accompanied by a training/capacity building plan for how to address each of the needs mentioned in the assessment recommendations. The outcome of this activity will</p>

Comments	Source	Team Response
		<p>inform the preparation and implementation of this investment.</p> <p>The team will also continue the close dialogue and consultation with the donors and international institutions and is looking forward to the cooperation with the German-supported water sector program. The development partners have been an integral part guiding the design of the PPCR in Yemen – and we will continue to seek for guidance and cooperation. The team responsible for the preparation and appraisal of the proposed investment would build strong operational links and where possible to plan joint field activities with the listed operations being funded by the German development cooperation.</p>
<p>Another central issue is to strengthen the understanding of the linkages between climate resilience and disaster risk management. We therefore recommend focusing on <b>training events in Component 1</b> to create the necessary preconditions for achieving the expected output and outcome. The training and awareness raising efforts should build on and make use of already existing structures (e.g. local institutions like the water user associations and/or water basin committees) to make sure that the right people are targeted and involved, and to ensure the understanding and the acceptance of the importance of the issue.</p>	<p><b>Germany</b></p>	<p>Thank you for this good recommendation. There should be a synergy with the Phase I PPCR in which the project is going to assess institutional capabilities to manage climate change information systems. This capacity assessment includes formal and informal community-based institutions such as Water User Associations, private sector etc. The activity also includes an assessment of the necessary specialized training needs. This will be accompanied by a training/capacity building plan for how to address each of the needs mentioned in the assessment recommendations. The outcome of this activity will inform the preparation and implementation of the training part in Component 1.</p>
<p>Taking into consideration limited capacities and extreme poverty especially in rural areas, <b>the training should raise a general understanding first before introducing payment for environmental services</b> or similar schemes since this might overburden local capacities.</p>	<p><b>Germany</b></p>	<p>It is a good point. We will make sure that the training will be programmed in sequence to help local authorities raise capacity step by step. The same is envisioned for farmers, who will be introduced to the concept through capacity building.</p>
<p>Another important issue is the consideration of Yemeni traditional knowledge. The people of Yemen have, especially in the rural areas, rich and broad traditional knowledge in how to deal with crisis and hazard situations. This profound know-how should be considered during project implementation. Supplementing the project activities, it probably would decrease the risk to inaction (see section F iv) and increase an active participation of communities (see comments on participation below).</p>	<p><b>Germany</b></p>	<p>We fully agree. Integrated community risk management will also aim at revitalizing some of the traditional risk mitigation measures and incorporate them into the early warning system as part of community development plans.</p>
<p><b>Comments on Cross-Cutting Issues</b></p>		
<p>The previously mentioned cross-cutting elements of the project design (awareness, gender, private sector involvement, education and research) provide a comprehensive approach. However, we would</p>	<p><b>Germany</b></p>	<p>Every effort would be made during project preparation and appraisal to engage the wider range of stakeholders in the design and implementation of the project. Every effort would be made to</p>

Comments	Source	Team Response
<p>suggest considering the following recommendations:</p> <p><u>Participation</u>            Enabling meaningful participation of broad sectors of society is crucial in Yemen. Especially after the political uprising due to the Arab Spring, with focus on youth, women and general civil society movements, strong involvement and active participation in development planning and implementation is needed more than ever. In addition to that, the participation of local communities is marked as being at risk (see section F iv). Therefore we recommend to consider explicitly and more precisely the <b>participation of a wide range of society stakeholder as well as the involvement of local communities in the project planning</b> and to involve both in the implementation. Besides crucial decision-makers on regional and local level should be involved in the project since they often proved to be a major asset or constraint in the implementation of planned activities</p>		<p>encourage community based organization and formal and informal leaders to take active role in the design and implementation and monitoring of project activities.</p> <p>The recommendation will be taken into account when conducting stakeholder analysis under Phase I PPCR, whose outcome will inform the preparation and implementation of this investment. This activity will identify in detail all the key stakeholders, both at national, regional and local level. It also includes formal and informal community-based institutions such as Water User Associations, private sector etc. All the investments supported by the PPCR are carrying out also regular civil society consultations – and the knowledge and guidance gained has shown the invaluable importance of engaging of a wide range of society stakeholders, thereby aiming to make a difference at the community level.</p>
<p><u>Gender</u>            Gender issues in adaptation are well defined and considered. Especially the focus on both, gender mainstreaming and specific gender initiatives such as income generation activities and mobilization of women farmers are highly appreciated. We would still recommend to ensure the <b>involvement and participation of women, especially regarding the social protection measures within the integrated community risk management (Component 2), during project implementation.</b> We suggest to not only measure women’s participation quota in meetings, trainings etc. but to make sure that the right socio-cultural setting is created where women have the chance to actively participate and bring in their opinions and needs.</p>	<p><b>Germany</b></p>	<p>Thanks for the recommendation. During the detailed preparation and appraisal of this project, special effort will be made to design dedicated investment activities for local women groups to facilitate income generation and better health and child nutrition. We would like to emphasize that the benefits of devolution of development activities related to both water and agriculture could strengthen measures to ensure women’s representation and participation at the community level, and would have a positive influence on gender balance in the communities in question. This will be ensured by monitored the number of participating communities incorporating social protection measures in their development plans. These include specific measures to protect the poorest and most vulnerable (women, elders) through traditional community-based mechanisms such as mutual funds.</p>
<p><u>Learning</u>            Enabling learning-by-doing and sharing of lessons at different levels is emphasised clearly in the strategic knowledge management approach of Component 3. Similarly, scaling up processes is being discussed in detail in the project document. Still, two risks for effective learning, the institutional risk and the lack of coordination and collaboration between agencies (see sections F ii and iii) are being</p>	<p><b>Germany</b></p>	<p>Thank you for this helpful comment. As a first and important step, the Inter-Ministerial Committee on Climate Change (IMCCC) has been formally established, which is being supported by the Environment Protection Authority as its Technical Secretariat. Ongoing agricultural projects linked to this investment such as the Rainfed Agriculture and Livestock Project are actively supporting networks and user groups such as seed grower associations and rural</p>

Comments	Source	Team Response
<p>identified at the same time. Due to these persistent concerns we recommend including network building activities and setting up intersectoral platforms as part of the knowledge management mechanisms in order to ensure transparency, efficient information sharing and multiplier effects of the project. We also highly recommend using and building on already existing local structures in order to enhance information sharing, learning, and ultimately local empowerment and ownership. Local institutions such as the water user associations could be replicated in other areas, and locals already acting as facilitators or trainers could assist building capacity for new associations.</p>		<p>producer groups. These structures and experiences from forming user groups will be built on and linked up to a knowledge network under the project.</p>
<p><u>Synergies with other donors Climate Change Related Engagement in the Country / Region</u>  The project document foresees to ensure coordination of efforts among various actors (see section E). Germany has a long standing and profound experience in Yemen in key sectors mainly affected by climate change, such as integrated water resources management and food security.  We would encourage an involvement of or close links to the German-supported water sector program, which has been operating already since 2006 and is active in many fields of intervention that the proposal also targets. Among others, the program has supported the establishment of structures and institutions that enhance water resources management at the local and regional levels, such as the above mentioned water user associations and water basin committees.  For instance, the water sector program has long standing experience in the governorate of Amran in strengthening local communities and actors regarding water resources management and participatory decision making processes, with a special focus on women.</p>	<p><b>Germany</b></p>	<p>Thank you for this helpful advice. The team will continue the close dialogue and consultation with the donors and is looking forward to the cooperation with the Water Sector Program of the KfW and the GIZ (including CIM/DED) and the colleagues from the BGR. The team responsible for the preparation and appraisal of the proposed investment would build strong operational links and where possible to plan joint field activities with the listed operations being funded by the German development cooperation.</p>
<p>How much of the USD \$11m will be channelled through the Yemen Social Fund for Development (SFD)? Will this funding be separate, or part of the SFD's current budget and results framework?</p>	<p><b>UK</b></p>	<p>The bulk of the funding for the project will be channeled to SFD Agriculture and Rural Development Unit, corresponding to roughly 80-90% of the total USD 11 million. The remaining funding will be channeled to MAI Project Support Unit for technical support and capacity building of farmers for climate resilient agriculture (amounting to roughly 10-20% of funding). This arrangement is building on the structures established by the World Bank RALP and the GEF ACAP projects. This pilot project would rely on the established institutional arrangements and its staff and would be based on strong coordination between SFD and MAI as one of the goals of this pilot operation.</p>

Comments	Source	Team Response
		<p>As mentioned in the proposal, the Project Preparation Grant (PPG) will further develop the detailed implementation and funding arrangements and identify required capacity building/strengthening measures. This will be undertaken in a participatory process with all concerned government and non-government stakeholders to identify the comparative advantages of each entity and stakeholder vis a vis the activities as well as exact need for cooperation. The funding will be separate from the SFD's current budget and results framework. Specific indicators of activities will be developed during project preparation.</p>
<p>Part of the project will be focussed on mitigating the effects of climate change on women's livelihoods through the SFD. This is definitely a very important part of the proposal. However, participation by women in the current SFD Labor Intensive Works Program (LIWP) has been less than hoped. We would therefore request quantitative and qualitative supporting evidence on the levels of women's participation in the LIWP and other comparable projects, and more detail on plans to address this issue.</p>	<p><b>UK</b></p>	<p>Rather than the Labor Intensive Work Program, the proposal builds on the experiences of the RALP project, where women participation has been strong with up to 43% of beneficiaries in the livestock and seed production activities as per project monitoring. Nevertheless, the point is well taken and emphasis will be given that this suggestion would be reflected in the Results and Performance Framework of the project. Special gender sensitive indicators would be introduced in each framework to ensure appropriate monitoring of the impact on women as both stakeholders and beneficiaries of the proposed investment</p>