

February 12, 2013

**Comments from the United States on the Approval by Mail: PPCR Tajikistan:
Environmental Land Management and Rural Livelihoods Project (IBRD)**

Dear colleagues,

Thank you for this additional information. Unfortunately it does not yet answer our questions about the need for additional supervision resources. The ratio of preparation costs to supervision costs is skewed compared to other projects. It would be helpful to know why the supervision estimate decreased by \$90,000 but is still such a high percentage of the total supervision and preparation costs. While we understand that a community-driven approach that is field-intensive could have additional oversight requirements, additional detail would be helpful to outline these costs. Also, the explanation as to why the supervision costs are high note that an estimate for annual supervision costs in Tajikistan were used. However, there is no discussion as to whether that indicator is appropriate (e.g., is most of the supervision of past projects of infrastructure in Dushanbe or similar projects to this one?). Please provide additional detail to respond to these questions.

Thanks very much,

Elizabeth