

January 14, 2013

Response of the Government of Samoa and IBRD on the Approval by Mail: PPCR Samoa: Enhancing Climate Resilience for West Coast Road Project (IBRD)

Dear Andrea and CIF AU colleagues,

Please find attached for posting on the CIF website the joint Gov of Samoa / IBRD response to comments made by PPCR SC members in Oct 2012 on the Samoa: Enhancing Climate Resilience of West Coast Road Project (P126504).

Kindly let us know if you have any questions. Thanks!

Best,

Nancy

Samoa: Enhancing Climate Resilience of West Coast Road (P126504)

Matrix of Comments Received from, and Responses to, the Sub-Committee of the Pilot Program for Climate Change

October 18, 2012

Comments from AusAID	Responses
Introductory Comments: We would like to congratulate the Government of Samoa and IBRD for a well written proposal. The proposal complements other national infrastructure projects and NAPA priorities. The involvement of the same steering committee and the inclusion of project management technical assistance should ensure coordination. While we have no objection to the project moving to the next phase, have a few suggestions for consideration during implementation.	
Information to Support Climate Change: While the document provides a good overview, it is hard to discern whether sufficient information exists to	Samoa is still in the early stages of gathering information on climate change and its potential impact on infrastructure. However, it is clear that the

<p>support the climate change analysis for Components 1 and 2. As presented, it does not appear that any new information will be gathered, although there is reference to a ‘hydrology and hydraulic review’ for the drainage sites selected for Component 1 (top page 21). As such, it is hard to understand whether the impact information will be available to inform the project works and development of the strategy.</p>	<p>Samoa road network is vulnerable to a number of issues, including: (i) coastal exposure to sea-level rise, storm surge, wave action during cyclones and tsunamis; (ii) inland flooding and landslips during extreme rainfall events; (iii) damage from earthquakes; and (iv) accelerated pavement deterioration due to extreme weather and rising water tables in some locations. Roads are particularly susceptible to damage from flooding and poor drainage, which can quickly undermine their usefulness. Raising the overall height of the West Coast Road (WCR), sealing its shoulders, and installing adequate drainage systems will go a long way to reducing the WCR’s vulnerability to climate events. For Component 2, interaction with other donors active in climate adaptation for Samoa will serve to inform the assignment, broaden understanding, and support the development of a more appropriate and effective adaptation strategy for the road network (see responses below).</p>
<p>Better Technical Justification for Road Works: The technical appraisal (paras 45-47) could include more details. It refers only to international design standards, and previous work by the World Bank (of which we’d welcome copies). Without sighting this information, it is hard to tell whether this in itself provides a sufficient technical basis for a \$14m investment.</p>	<p>Noted. More detail on technical designs for the West Coast Road will be included in the relevant sections of the Project Appraisal Document (PAD).</p>
<p>Interaction with PACCSAP: The approach outlined for Component 2 is good, and may align with work already underway by Australia’s Pacific-Australia Climate Change Science and Adaptation Planning (PACCSAP) project (specifically to support climate resilient infrastructure development, about which Australia has been engaging with Government of Samoa counterparts, World Bank and ADB – amongst others). We’d welcome the opportunity to discuss further, use of data and modelling that is proposed for development under the PACCSAP – available in June 2013. This entails the collection of high resolution topographic and bathymetric imagery around Apia Harbour and also at the international airport and port at Mulifanua – which is a fundamental input for understanding the impacts from storm surge. While PACCSAP is not able to obtain this imagery for the whole coastline, it may provide some opportunity for</p>	<p>An excellent suggestion. The Project Team has been in touch with the regional Pacific - Australia Climate Change Science and Adaptation Planning Program about opportunities to collaborate on improving the resilience of infrastructure design and planning in Samoa. This interaction will continue throughout implementation.</p>

<p>the World Bank to model impacts at selected sites (Vaitele-Fale'ula area, for example). Separately, CSIRO has been modelling extreme high tide values for Apia, which can be used for inundation modelling, or more complex wave impact modelling, should the World Bank wish to incorporate this into the WCR project.</p>	
<p style="text-align: center;">Comments from Government of Germany</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Responses</p>
<p>Introductory Comments: We would like to commend all involved parties for submitting a well prepared proposal. The proposed project is a temporary solution while the complex recommendation to move the West Coast Road further inland can be addressed. The West Coast Road is an important transportation link between the capital city, Apia, the Faleolo airport and the Mulifanua inter-island ferry wharf, which provides access to another important Samoan island, Savai'i. Running parallel to the coastline, this vital transportation link is susceptible to increased rainfall, resulting in flooding and damage to the road itself. Of particular importance is that on the eastern end, the water table is already high, resulting in direct damage to the road pavement and sub-surface as a result of high precipitation events. Given the strategic importance of the road for the country's economy, we fully support the objective of enhancing the resilience of the road network to climate change in Samoa. We do however have some questions and concerns regarding the projects indicators, which are too much input-oriented, and fail to measure whether the project is actually achieving its objectives, and whether it does make a measurable contribution to building climate resilience.</p> <p>We would like to suggest, that our recommendations (see bold highlights below) be incorporated during project implementation.</p>	<p>In terms of the project indicators, the team considered a range of potential output indicators that might appropriately reflect the effectiveness of the chosen measures to improve the resilience of the WCR. However, a lack of baseline data and the need for climatic events (storm surges, flooding and tsunamis) to strike the road over a period of years after project completion rendered most indicators unsuitable and/or ineffective.</p>
<p>Individual Comments:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is little disclosure about the science or the assumptions used to assess how the hazards to the West Coast Road may be exacerbated by climate change and whether these road treatments are a match for the impacts expected due to climate change. There is mention of international standards, however no discussion to assess whether they are an improvement and if so, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The scope of proposed interventions to increase resilience directly responds – within the context of maintaining the existing road alignment - to the documented and reported increasing threats to road users (intense rainfall causing frequent flooding, road closures and surface damage, high water tables causing pavement layer damage, and storm surges causing inundation

<p>adequate for Samoa’s needs. We would appreciate the proposal being more explicit about the context.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the interest of sustainability and given the high dependency on the West Coast Road, it would be beneficial for Samoa to also integrate adaptation efforts related to electricity distribution, telephone, and water services etc. that depend on the West Coast Road in some form for the delivery of their services. • As for safety – visibility is a major safety consideration during rain events, whereby painted lines, reflecting surfaces, lighting would greatly improve drivability and safety. 	<p>and erosion of low-lying, coast-hugging sections of road) –through improved drainage, raising of low sections, sealing shoulders and side-slope protection. These interventions will be subject to detailed designs incorporating appraisal of the increasing severity of each threat.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agreed. Provision is made in the design phase of project implementation to use the opportunity of the proposed interventions to assess the vulnerability of all public utility services along the road and to integrate their adaptation, where possible. • As part of project preparation, a road safety audit was completed on the WCR in June 2011. The audit identified a series of measures to improve safety along the WCR, and key recommendations from the audit will be incorporated in the design of works under the CRWCR. These will include constructing bus stops, line marking to delineate pedestrian crossings, and erecting signage for bus stops and pedestrian crossings.
<p>Participation: The proposal does not mention the consultation with the local population regarding land acquisition, easements and impacts to residents. Therefore we recommend including clarification on the participatory process and if not done, directly involving the local communities in the planning and implementation of the project.</p>	<p>Consultations with local communities were carried out during project preparation and will continue throughout implementation. A framework approach to land issues was developed, which built on lessons learned in resolving land issues under the World Bank’s Second Infrastructure Asset Management Project. This framework will be upgraded to a detailed management plan for managing land issues once detailed designs for the road are available. Access to properties for construction works and negotiation of easements will be required, but it is not expected that major land acquisition or resettlement will be necessary. An Environmental Code of Practice (ECOP) has been prepared and will be embedded in contractual documents of contractors for all works and monitored by MNRE.</p>
<p>Gender:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This is a rather conventional infrastructure investment project and it may be difficult to address gender aspects in such a project. However, in our view the 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As noted in the PAD (Main Text, para 55 and Annex 4, para 39), a survey of beneficiaries along the West Coast Road (WCR), with particular

<p>project document does not yet elaborate sufficiently how (negative) impacts to women and young children due to the disruption of services during construction are identified and treated. We therefore recommend that greater attention be paid to gender aspects and to ensure that the local women’s organisations are consulted about plans affecting them. Also, identify with Ministry of Health the potential health and hygiene benefits to residents as a result of better drainage.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We seriously doubt that disclosing information on land acquisition and resettlement via the <i>Land Transport Authority’s</i> website will actually reach the majority of the concerned population, and recommend using alternative channels of communication in addition. 	<p>attention to women, will be carried out during the design phase of the road works to determine how best to ensure that their needs are adequately addressed under the project. Key recommendations will be communicated to the design consultants and incorporated in the WCR’s design package.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A Land Acquisition and Resettlement Framework (LARF) and Environmental Code of Practices (ECOP) were prepared for the project, subsequently adopted by the Government and disclosed on the websites of the Land Transport Authority (LTA) and the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environments (MNRE), as well as at the Bank’s InfoShop in August 2012. In addition, hard copies of both documents will be available at the LTA, MNRE and the Project Management Unit. We will also discuss making these documents available at public libraries and local universities.
<p>Synergies with German Climate Change Related Engagement in the Country / Region: To strengthen the capacities of Samoa and other Pacific islands to better cope with the predicted effects of climate change, the <i>Secretariat of the Pacific Community</i> (SPC) in cooperation with Germany started a regional programme in January 2009. The programme is funded by the <i>German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development</i> (BMZ) and implemented by GIZ. Since 2011, the programme is called <i>Coping with Climate Change in the Pacific Island Region</i> (SPC/GIZ CCCPIR), operating with an increased budget of 17.2 million € in 12 countries. The project proposal does acknowledge already the BMZ funded CCCPIR in the region. The programme is developing the national, overarching implementation strategy and plan for climate change adaptation in Samoa, in order to align the plans/frameworks and take advantage of synergies with other sectors. As the proposed project aims to develop a national framework for the road network and adaptation to climate change, it would be beneficial to work together with CCCPIR-Samoa.</p>	<p>Fully agree. Interaction with the CCCPIR-Samoa and other donors active in climate adaptation for Samoa would be beneficial, especially for the work associated with Component 2. Our counterparts are aware of the CCCPIR, but we will bring this to their attention and ask them to reach out to the CCCPIR other partners active in climate change.</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Comments from Government of Japan</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Responses</p>
<p>Board Date: Expected Board approval date is December 2013 and not</p>	<p>The expected Board approval date is December 2012, not December 2013.</p>

December 2012?	
According to JICA Samoa office, road expansion is now being undertaken around Vailoa Junction. Is this Government's co-finance portion?	Under the World Bank-financed Second Infrastructure Asset Management Project, about 650 meters of Vaitele Street is being widened to four lanes up to Vailoa Junction. Improvements under the CRWCR will begin from these improvements.
This project is not overlapped with JICA projects, and it would be good if this project could complement training on road administration done in Japan. We will provide you the detail of the training shortly.	We look forward to receiving this information.

