Comments from Germany on Bolivia's Strategic Programme for Climate Resilience

Dear Patricia and Andrea,

pls find attached our comments for the above mentioned project proposal and SPCR's as discussed in the PPCR meeting.

Thank you again for your as always extremely helpful preparation, support and guidance for the meetings!

Kind regards Annette

Dr. Annette Windmeisser Klimapolitik und Klimafinanzierung Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung

Summary

We would like to congratulate the Government of Bolivia (GoB), especially the Ministries of *Development Planning* and *Environment and Water*, for designing and presenting a comprehensive SPCR document. The SPCR document contains detailed information about the processes undertaken to develop the proposed program components, as well as well-founded arguments for selecting **water resources** as the focus of the PPCR in Bolivia.

Information provided about the current climate change situation in-country, its impacts on water availability, combined with a consideration of Bolivia's development priorities (as set forth in the *National Development Plan*) and development challenges, all underscore the need to increase resilience to climate change impacts on water resources, as a matter of environmental, social and economic urgency.

In addition to providing an overview of climate-related challenges by region, the SPCR reviews the **policy and institutional frameworks** that are needed to complement and support the implementation of the PPCR, describes how **gender considerations** will be incorporated into the various programme activities (see Annex 4 of the SPCR), and details various **participatory processes** that ultimately contributed to a consensus on the final document.

We particularly welcome the SPCR's commitment to target certain interventions that will address specific challenges and risks crucial to the long-term success of water resource management, for example, efforts to improve climate and hydrological data with SENAMHI, as well as efforts to improve **inter-governmental coordination** at all levels

of government through support of the *National Climate Change Program*. The **focus on improving data quality**, data availability and data analysis will be the foundation for informing adaptation decisions country-wide. We also are encouraged to see that a special program will be started to manage issues arising from **impacts of the program on vulnerable groups.**

Overall, **there are no major objections** from our point of view. We suggest taking the recommendations (see **bold** highlights below) into account during the next steps of programme implementation.

General Comments

SPCR Overview

The SPCR outlines three program components which are summarized below:

Component 1: Strengthening the National Capacity to Manage Climate Change

Component 1 will create the tools, mechanisms and methodologies that will allow for the *Integrated River-Basin Management* (IRBM) approach, applied by components 2 and 3 in priority pilot areas, to be successfully applied in other basins of the country. Specifically, the focus will be on improving the information base by strengthening data availability, data analysis and the generation of information required to diagnose and develop responses to climate change in the water sector; as well as on strengthening public sector capacity to replicate the experiences of the pilot areas.

Component 2: Climate Resilience Program for the Water and Sanitation Systems of the Metropolitan Areas of El Alto and La Paz

The overall objective of the component is to increase the resilience of the entire water supply system of La Paz and El Alto. The specific objectives are: (i) to guarantee the continuity and the quality of the water system in the metropolitan areas of La Paz and El Alto; (ii) to allow the expansion of coverage; (iii) to generate experiences and lessons to integrate climate change in the planning, design and implementation of water projects in the high mountain; (iv) to start the preparation and implementation of a pilot project of an IRBM plan that is multipurpose, participatory, sustainable, resilient and includes the gender dimension; and (v) lay the groundwork to have a climate resilient water system for the metropolitan areas of La Paz and El Alto.

Component 3: Strengthening the Resilience to Climate Change in the Rio Grande Basin

The **main objective** of this Component is to increase resilience to climate change in two pilot sub-basins of the Rio Grande basin: the sub-basin of the *Mizque River* in the upper basin and the sub-basin of the *Piraí River* in the lower basin. A **second objective** is to generate concrete experiences in planning, designing and implementation of integral investments that are resilient to climate change, whose results and lessons learned will be the basis for setting or adjusting national standards for public planning and investment, for possible replication in other regions and sectors.

Comments on Individual Components / Projects / Measures

Component 1: Strengthening the National Capacity to Manage Climate Change

Managing social conflict: the proposal shows that many lessons have been learned since the water wars that took place in Bolivia over a decade ago, with the inclusion of affected stakeholders in the planning of the SPCR. In order to minimize the potential for conflict, the government should continue to be the face of future consultations in order to avoid misperceptions that the program interventions are the work of third parties.

Comments on indicators

We would like to suggest the following modifications to some of the indicators:

- The availability of climate change scenarios of high resolution in the areas of intervention, that are easily accessible and understandable to decision makers, experts and the general public
- Number of institutions where relevant staff, disaggregated by sex and by institution, has been trained in the use of high resolution scenarios and other climate information to help in decision making processes
- Number of publications on methodologies applied and lessons learned under the SPCR
 - This indicator should include some measure of quality of the publications and dissemination of the lessons through, workshops, etc.

Component 2: Climate Resilience Program for the Water and Sanitation Systems of the Metropolitan Areas of El Alto and La Paz

Please provide additional information about how **storage capacity** can be increased to counteract the effects of glacier retreat. Given the historic sensitivities of paying for drinking water in Bolivia, please provide more information about how **rate structures** will be established to ensure the needed revenues for system maintenance and water treatment, etc.

Component 3: Strengthening the Resilience to Climate Change in the Rio Grande Basin

With regard to Subcomponent 3.ii: Structural measures such as reforestation, construction of small/medium-sized reservoirs, measures for protection against erosion, etc. We would like to point to the experience of PROAGRO (GIZ) with constructing atajados (small reservoirs) at the household level and would encourage an exchange of experiences on this issue.

With regard to Subcomponent 4: The strengthening of the *Commonwealth of the Southern Cone* so that its members can participate in the formulation and monitoring of the river basin plan. We would draw attention to other global efforts, including GIZ experience working with for example the *Mekong River Commission* or the *Nile Basin Initiative* on trans-boundary river basin management, and encourage an exchange of experience.

With regard to risks, it would be helpful to see how the SPCR will respond specifically to each risk and gauge its seriousness (low, medium, high). A tabular format to lay out risk, proposed response measures and level of risk would be useful.

With regard to the Preparatory Project for Component 3: Hydro-meteorological information system diagnosis at the national level and action plan (including budget) to strengthen it. This assessment will consider all the chain, starting with data collection and storage, quality control of data, information generation, and its use in decision making. It will identify the main constraints (technical, financial, human resources, etc.). We would ask that the output of the assessment also include a concrete plan for how to improve information where it is presently lacking, i.e. not just a list of constraints.

Comments on Cross-Cutting Issues

Participation

The various participatory processes that were carried out as part of the preparation of the SPCR are well-documented. A challenge remains for communities that will be affected (or displaced) as part of the infrastructure plans in Component 2. **Participatory processes and transparency about planned actions will continue to be important throughout the life of the programme.**

Gender

Women have been identified as particularly vulnerable to the negative impacts of climate change in Bolivia. Gender aspects have been widely taken into account in the analytical parts of the SPCR. We recommend developing gender-sensitive impact indicators that go beyond disaggregating data on staff trainings (Component 1), and to include gender-sensitive indicators in the M&E system that is to be developed for Component 1. For Component 2, the SPCR could include in the indicator that measures the number of projects and programs in the metropolitan area, which are designed to reduce climate vulnerability, how to take gender into account. For Component 3, the SPCR might consider how migration patterns in and out of the two sub-basins impact gender.

Synergies with German Climate Change Related Engagement in the Country / Region

GIZ, through the BMZ-funded PROAGRO Programme¹ in Bolivia, participated in several of the consultations for the development of the SPCR, including consultations on the *Mizque River Sub-basin*, in the focus group on gender and climate change, and in the meeting with representatives of international cooperation in Bolivia. PROAGRO is

¹ Note that there may be an error on page 40 in Table 5. PROAGRO is funded with 17 mio €, including 8 mio € of co-financing from SIDA.

specifically cited in the SPCR for its work on piloting gender-sensitive approaches in water-resource management.

We would encourage an active cooperation between GIZ and the PPCR in Bolivia to ensure ongoing donor harmonization and cooperation on the many issues of mutual interest. In addition to PROAGRO, GIZ is implementing a regional program in four Andean countries, including Bolivia, with a focus on water resource management. GIZ also implements a water and sanitation programme for small and medium-sized cities in Bolivia called PROAPAC.