



AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT
BANK GROUP

AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

ONE WIND ENERGY PLAN MOROCCO

CTF Appraisal Document: External Peer Review Comments and Responses

Details of External Peer Reviewer:

Stephen Karekezi

Director

AFREPREN/FWD

Elgeyo Marakwet Close, Kilimani

P. O. Box 30979, 00100 GPO

Nairobi

Kenya

Peer Reviewer Comments	Text Reference if applicable	Team's response
In my opinion this is a very sound project and meets all the relevant CTF investment criteria.		Noted.
As a general comment on the CTF proposal for Morocco, I suggest put a few lines describing what the integrated project is and what component is for CTF funding. This does not become clear until P. 10 in Section 5 on Project Description. More details are in form of track changes in the attached document.	p.1-10	Noted and incorporated in CTF appraisal document.
Should there not be a financial analysis results presented to indicate what the project FIRR and EIRR would be?		Noted.
More information and discussion on current local manufacturing and future capacity would be useful. Also likewise, how many skilled jobs would be created by the project and future growth based on the projection of future wind generation?	Para 7.4, p.19	The information is provided on para 7.4, p.19The WEP is expected to create a significant amount of Green Jobs. About 700 direct permanent jobs in maintenance of the wind farms, as well as over direct 4200 one-year jobs in construction are being expected. Local manufacturing of the equipment is estimated to create additional jobs. In accordance with international research about 4-5 permanent jobs per MW, implying about 4000-5000 total green jobs created though WEP
How much reduction in CO2 emission is anticipated?	Para 7.1; p.17	The information requested is presented in para 7.1 on page 17."Using this multiplying factor, ONE has calculated that the 1070 MW of WEP will reduce greenhouse gas emissions to the equivalent of 33 78 35 52 metric tons of CO2. The lifetime CO2 offset of the proposed projectprogram will exceed Morocco's annual carbon emissions for 1 year."
What are some of the uncertainties – e,g, in case of SA it was related to who	Table 7, page 23	The information on risks is presented in table 7,page 23.

will pay for the wheeling charges and connection to the main grid...		
This is an attractive and innovative program that deserves broad support from the sustainable energy community. It provides a model combining clean energy, enhanced energy security as well as broading access to electricity to lower income communities of Morocco.		Noted.
The document mentions the number of jobs that are likely to be generated by the ONE Wind Energy Program as well as the possibility of local manufacture. Additional details on how local manufacture will be encouraged would strengthen the document. For example, the Wind Energy Program could aim to establish a minimum of one or two locally-based manufacturing entities that assembles or manufacture wind-power equipment or components.	Section 2 & Section 7.3:	Noted. The number of jobs is estimated based on international average value per MW of RE.
Would be useful to provide additional details on the planned special account for development activities that will funds generated from the payment of required land by ONE for the windfarms. For example, an estimate of the amount that will be deposited into the Special Account and expected number of development projects/ beneficiaries	Section 4	Noted and adjusted in text
Additional details on exactly how the combined wind/hydro hybrid will work would be useful. For example, reference to more detailed modeling would be re-assuring even if it is for a subset of the ONE WEP program or based on simulation.	Section 5.	Noted and Incorporated.
It would also be important to note that the windpower farms would provide an important mitigating protection against drought-related hydropower generation shortages. In others words, wind/hydro hybrids systems do not only enhance the reliability of the	Section 5.	Noted and will be analyzed further.

<p>wind part of the system but can also provide some protection to drought-related hydropower generation problems.</p>		
<p>Section 7.3. The ONE Wind Energy Plan would not only have a strong demonstration impact on the North African region but is likely to stimulate the development of hydro/wind hybrid systems in many other parts of Africa, notably East Africa and parts of Southern Africa which are equally well endowed with a combination of wind and hydro resources.</p>	<p>p. 20</p>	<p>Noted and incorporated in CTF appraisal document.</p>